

## The New High School in São Paulo: old proposals for maintaining the structural duality and the precariousness of education

**Celso do Prado Ferraz de Carvalho** 

Nove de Julho University, São Paulo, SP, Brazil

**Fabio Cavalcanti** 

Nove de Julho University, São Paulo, SP, Brazil

### Abstract

The Reform of Secondary Education and the National Curricular Common Base propose significant changes for secondary education and establish new bases for its organization. The objective of this article is to present general aspects of the High School Reform and the National Common Curriculum Base, specifically the flexibility of the curriculum and the centrality assumed by the training itineraries, having as a reference the process of implementation by the Secretary of Education in the State of São Paulo of the New Paulista High School. It is a documentary and bibliographic study. As primary sources of analysis, the curriculum and management documents produced by the aforementioned secretariat were used. The results of the analysis corroborate the studies by Ferretti (2018), Ramos (2019) and Ramos and Frigotto (2017): the High School Reform fosters uncertainties, disqualifies the curriculum, makes it difficult for public school students to access knowledge historically produced by humanity and contributes to the maintenance of structural duality and to the destruction of public education.

### Keywords

High School Reform; BNCC; formation itineraries; New High School Paulista.

### O Novo Ensino Médio Paulista: velhas propostas de manutenção da dualidade estrutural e da precarização do ensino

### Resumo

A Reforma do Ensino Médio e a Base Nacional Curricular Comum propõem mudanças significativas para o Ensino Médio e estabelecem novas bases para a sua organização. O objetivo deste artigo é apresentar aspectos gerais da Reforma do Ensino Médio e da Base Nacional Curricular Comum, especificamente a flexibilização do currículo e a centralidade assumida pelos itinerários formativos, tendo como referência o processo de implementação pela Secretaria da Educação no Estado de São Paulo do Novo Ensino Médio Paulista. É um estudo de caráter documental e bibliográfico. Como fontes primárias de análise, utilizaram-se os documentos curriculares e de gestão produzidos pela referida secretaria. Os resultados da análise corroboram os estudos de Ferretti (2018), Ramos (2019) e Ramos e Frigotto (2017): a Reforma do Ensino Médio fomenta incertezas, desqualifica o currículo, dificulta o acesso dos alunos das escolas públicas ao conhecimento historicamente produzido pela humanidade e contribui para a manutenção da dualidade estrutural e para a destruição da educação pública.

### Palavras-chave

Reforma do Ensino Médio; BNCC; itinerários formativos; Novo Ensino Médio Paulista.

## El Nuevo Bachillerato Paulista: viejas propuestas para mantener la dualidad estructural y la precariedad de la educación

### Resumen

La Reforma de la Enseñanza Media y la Base Común Curricular Nacional proponen cambios significativos para la Educación Secundaria y establecen nuevas bases para su organización. El objetivo de este artículo es presentar aspectos generales de la Reforma de la Enseñanza Media y la Base Curricular Común Nacional, específicamente la flexibilización del currículo y la centralidad que asumen los itinerarios formativos, teniendo como referencia el proceso de implementación por parte de la Secretaría de Educación del Estado de São Paulo del Nuevo Bachillerato Paulista. Es un estudio documental y bibliográfico. Como fuentes primarias de análisis se utilizaron los documentos curriculares y de gestión elaborados por la mencionada secretaría. Los resultados del análisis corroboran los estudios de Ferretti (2018), Ramos (2019) y Ramos y Frigotto (2017): la Reforma de la Enseñanza Media fomenta incertidumbres, descalifica el currículo, dificulta el acceso de los alumnos de las escuelas públicas a los saberes producidos históricamente por la humanidad y contribuye al mantenimiento de la dualidad estructural y a la destrucción de la educación pública.

### Palabras clave

Reforma de la Educación Secundaria; BNCC; itinerarios formativos; Nuevo Bachillerato Paulista.

## 1 Introduction

In the last 20 years, the most diverse educational policies, especially those aimed at professional qualification, have disseminated theses proposing a new model of education and training. In the context of these policies, High School proposed reforms have prominence. One of the common aspects of these policies is the emphasis on the need to overcome the historical problems of High School, specifically the absence of terminality and the presence of a pedagogical organization and conception, which helped to consolidate the structural duality that characterizes it.

These policies share the emphasis with which they disseminate the discourse about the need for a new organization and structure for High School, which would provide grounds for improving the general student training but also for professional education.

In the 1990s, the reformist discourse announced education as fundamental to dealing with the demands posed by the new work organization processes. Therefore, it was necessary to improve the education of workers, expand basic education and improve education quality indicators.

The debate about High School and its implications for professional training was laden with concepts such as competencies, knowledge, and curriculum flexibility. The thesis stated that new work organization and production forms demanded new educational models and professional training. This idea was disseminated by the discourse in defense of entrepreneurship, employability, and an education based on skills, competencies, and technical knowledge necessary for the new worker's qualification.

In this context of educational reforms and the outcry for an education that would improve workers' training, High School became part of Basic Education and it was defined as a level of education that should enable the mastery of the knowledge required by the new work processes.

About 20 years after the beginning of the last reform, High School is once again at the center of the educational discussion. Once again, the argument used to justify the need for reforms focuses on the need to adapt to the labor market. In this context, High School was deeply impacted by two policies that emerged from this new reformist wave: the 2017 High School Reform and the definition of a new Base Nacional Comum Curricular (BNCC) in 2018.

Both the 2017 High School Reform and the elaboration of a new BNCC completed in 2018 propose significant changes for High School and establish new bases for its organization. It's our initial understanding that this process accentuates the problems that already exist in High School and maintains the logic of duality that characterizes it. Fully training students and preparing them for the employment market continues to be the central issues of the debate, although putting it in new words.

Faced with the stipulations posed by the High School Reform and the new curriculum proposed by the BNCC, the process of implementation by the São Paulo State Department of Education (Seduc-SP) of the New Paulista High School began.

## 2 Methodology

This article seeks to present the general aspects of the High School Reform and the new BNCC, specifically the proposal of the curriculum organization, with training

itineraries as a central point, and discuss its impacts on the students' training. We problematize the training itineraries and the changes they generate in the organization of the teacher's work since they modify the workload and interfere in the allotment of the subject over the three years of High School.

This is a documental and bibliographic study. For this purpose, we used as primary sources the curriculum and management documents recently written by Seduc-SP, specifically the Currículo Paulista - High School (SÃO PAULO, 2020a), the Seminar New High School Principals (SÃO PAULO, 2021b) and the curriculum broadening detailed syllabus directory (SÃO PAULO, 2021a). In addition to these curricular documents, the Seduc Resolution nº 85/2020 (SÃO PAULO, 2020b) was analyzed, which established the guidelines for the curricular organization of Elementary School, High School, and the respective teaching modalities of São Paulo State Education System, the legislation establishing the 2017 High School Reform (BRASIL, 2017) and the BNCC final document for High School (BRASIL, 2018).

The source analysis deployed had basis on a conceptual and theoretical reference of studies about high school produced according to the critical theory of education, specifically the researchers Celso João Ferretti (FERRETTI, 2018), Marise Nogueira Ramos (RAMOS, 2019), Gaudêncio Frigotto (RAMOS; FRIGOTTO, 2017) and Dermeval Saviani (SAVIANI, 2007).

### **3 High School once again reformed and the BNCC**

Initially, it's necessary to remember that the 2017 High School Reform and the elaboration of the BNCC took place amid a tense political phase marked by the 2016 coup. This context defined which movements participated in the elaboration and which did not. The High School Reform took place in Michel Temer's presidency. The elaboration of the BNCC began in the Dilma Rousseff government and different phases, with three versions produced, with the third and final version undergoing significant changes compared with the previous versions. The BNCC specifically designed for High School didn't went throught debates, its wording was settled without the participation of significant segments like researchers and teachers interested in High School.

The High School Reform took place with the enactment of Law nº 13.415/2017 and was subject to intense criticism due to the proposed measures' extent and the lack of discussion, specifically the curricular changes, the reorganization of the workload and the creation of training itineraries. One of the main arguments supporting the need for reform was that the results measured by large-scale assessments, such as the Exame Nacional do Ensino Médio (Enem) and the Prova Internacional de Avaliação de Alunos (Pisa), were unsatisfactory and below the targets of the Índice de Desenvolvimento da Educação Básica (Ideb). Another factor cited was the curriculum sprawling in several non-articulated disciplines, which would be one of the reasons for the students' lack of interest and the cause of school dropout. Regarding these issues, the strong appeal for High School to have a more focused purpose and professional training were arguments used to justify the need for yet another reform in high school.

According to Ramos (2019), the 2017 High School Reform was arranged earlier, in 2016, when Brazil was experiencing a state of exception and in the context of the civil, legal, media, and parliamentary coup against President Dilma Rousseff. The conjugation of forces favorable to the capital provided regressive and reactionary processes. In this state of exception, “[...] the high school counter-reform is the expression of this reaction of the ruling class, which undertakes it through the permanent exception conjugated [sic] with the achievement of consensus” (RAMOS, 2019, p. 10).

It's important to mention other scholars who share this critique of the reform, such as Ferretti (2018), Hernandez (2019), Ramos (2019), and Ramos and Frigotto (2016). In common, they warned about the reductionist character that characterizes the reform and its training perspective, its instrumental and hastened conception of professional training, as well as its authoritarian character, given the scarce discussion that took place and its hurried approval in the National Congress.

Ramos and Frigotto (2016) warned that the High School Counter-Reform, after the coup d'état, was an attack against the achievements and advances of a Basic Education established from a perspective of a single and integrated training of students (RAMOS; FRIGOTTO, 2016).

The BNCC defined the minimum curriculum, and the local curricula must be contextualized and defined by the individual, local and social reality of each school

and its students. The document is structured around ten general competencies, which should be connected within the wide areas of knowledge and their technologies, throughout the educational process of the students throughout their education. In general, the ten general competencies explain cognitive processes that must occur for the development of skills and formation of attitudes and values, as was already recommended in Law No. 9,394/1996. BNCC is a national reference for all curricula with a normative character that defines the organic and progressive set of essential Basic Education learnings, BNCC will also establish all public policies in Brazil, from teacher training to school infrastructure.

The High School Reform and the BNCC establish changes in Brazilian education on two fundamental aspects: change in the workload and restructuring of the curricular organization. For Hernandez (2019, p. 14), by imposing a limit of 1,800 hours of work in compliance with the BNCC and the rest of the workload with training itineraries, the High School Reform “[...] might open spaces for state mandate cuts in the budget and resources that should be allocated to education”. This perspective reinforces High School policies dating back to the 1970s that have been linked to the interests of the capitalist economy, seeking to define this final stage of Basic Education as instrumental training instead of a broader formation of the human being.

In the following part of the article, we show and discuss the direct consequences of the High School Reform and the BNCC in São Paulo education due to the implementation of the so-called New São Paulo High School.

#### 4 The New Paulista High School

With a proposal based on the general guidelines of the High School Reform and the BNCC, the government of the state of São Paulo, through Seduc-SP, prepared the final version of the Currículo Paulista - High School (SÃO PAULO, 2020a), with approval on July 29, 2020, by the Conselho Estadual de Educação de São Paulo (CEE-SP). The Currículo Paulista - High School brings the new approach of the New High School to face the old challenges of Basic Education not only in São Paulo but also in Brazilian education.

As well as the curriculum for Kindergarten and Elementary Education, the Currículo Paulista: High School was created with the input of several institutions from different segments of society. Unlike the previous curriculum proposal, from 2008 to 2017, in which only a few teaching researchers had direct participation in its formulation, without popular consultation. Entities like Associação Brasileira de Ensino de Ciências Sociais, Ayrton Senna Institute and the Lemann Foundation and the Universidade Estadual Paulista (Unesp), among other institutions participated in the formulation of this document inaugurates a new stage in public education policies in the state of São Paulo. The strong influence of agents from private organizations, directly influenced by neoliberalism, on São Paulo and national educational policies is documented in the literature (FERRETTI, 2018; RAMOS; FRIGOTTO, 2016), even before the implementation of the 2020 Currículo Paulista.

The document shows the involvement of 98,856 participants, including students, education professionals, and civil society in the state and the 645 municipalities from that state (SÃO PAULO, 2020a). The participation of almost one hundred thousand people in this curriculum proposal is very similar to the public consultation carried out by the BNCC for High School in the 2017-2018 biennium held by the federal government. With a new proposal for the curriculum, this document also featured several regional seminars in 2019. According to the document, students and education professionals from municipal, private, and state systems participated. Another unprecedented feat was the consultation using a web site<sup>1</sup> to map students' aspirations and subsidize the construction of this document, which had the participation of more than one hundred and sixty thousand students from the state educational system. This student consultation, among other questions, wanted to know which training itineraries they would like to choose from areas of knowledge in addition to the deepening of technical and professional training.

According to the New Currículo Paulista (SÃO PAULO, 2020a), with the aid of pedagogical proposals from schools, it intends to fill the educational gap in a complex society. This society has multiple cultural, ethnic, and linguistic identities, seeks equity, and, at the same time, wants each student to be seen as unique. For the Currículo Paulista, equity means that all students are in a quality public school, in their own time

<sup>1</sup> Porvir site (2019): <https://porvir.org/nossaescolarelatorio/>. Access on: 11 Dec. 2020.

and space, guaranteed by the Lei de Diretrizes e Bases da Educação Nacional (LDBEN), respecting all social interactions that work in the state.

This concern with the socio-emotional state reveals a certain contradiction, as the current school system undergoes changes generated by cultural, economic, and political crises, revealing the strengthening of the current social reproduction, meaning that the school for the neediest will be the same as always with the least possible content (see curricular flexibility) as an aggravator factor. The current generation of high school students lives in a society of crisis and risk. According to Ramos and Frigotto (2016, p. 42):

The rhythm of the school, the very tradition of the modern schooling, doesn't allow fast the incorporation of changes, and we shouldn't expect it to do so since one of the meanings behind the creation of the school is to constitute it as a space for the socialization of young people in the tradition of a society. Tradition in the sense of the culture that society has built so far gives it cohesion and, at the same time, makes conflict possible. This is how society sustains itself; it's necessary to know, incorporate the tradition itself, question it, and transform it. So, in fact, the school doesn't change as dynamically as social and cultural contexts, because the confrontation between tradition and change, the old and the new, is formative. At the same time, the ruling class has historically subordinated the school to the economy, making economism the hegemonic ideology that tries to explain and organize its functions. But it's on the plane of contradictions that this institution shows itself to be, simultaneously, capable of reproducing discourses and resistant to them; for this reason, it's also a space of dispute.

It is necessary to be careful when glamorizing the school, mainly due to the disciplines imposed by the Programa Inova Educação (electives, life project, and technology), with the supposed concern with the development of students' socio-emotional skills and letting them choose knowledge content from the training itineraries. We understand that, like Ramos and Frigotto (2016, p. 42), “[...] the main challenge of the school is not only to try to converge the interests of young people but to educate within their interests”. The role of the school goes far beyond socio-emotional skills. Knowing the students' interests, the school must confront these interests with the training needs together with a social project in which the school curriculum is based on culture, science, technology, and work.

The guidelines of the 2017 Reform and the BNCC that are in process of implementation in the São Paulo state education system produce significant changes in High School organization. The previous high school organization dictated that the

workload for the three years of high school in São Paulo would be 3,000 hours (1,000 hours per year). In the current format, defined by the Novo Ensino Médio Paulista, the workload is now 3,150 hours for the three years (1,050 hours per year), with a maximum of 1,800 hours for the contents defined by the BNCC and 1,350 hours dedicated to training itineraries.

In the structure proposed by Seduc-SP, the training itineraries must be organized in such a way as to include 900 hours for curricular deepening and 450 hours for the diversified part, as defined by Inova Educação. Inova Educação was created by Seduc-SP to offer new opportunities to students through three new curricular components: an elective subject plus Technology and Life Project. According to the document that defines the objectives of Inova Educação (SÃO PAULO, 2021b), the elective discipline will have two weekly classes and constitutes a curricular component in which students can make choices from a range of disciplines offered each semester, an opportunity so that the students begins to decide what they want to learn and to become the protagonist of their own education. The Technology curricular component will have a weekly class and aims at creative and collaborative learning for training of thoughtful users and potential new technologies creators and should provide students with the possibility of deepening knowledge of their chosen training itinerary. The Life Project, with two weekly classes, is a curricular component that aims to stimulate, guide, and direct the students on which itinerary to choose and understand that the future will be a consequence of choices made in the present. The stated objective is that these subjects can bring to high school students innovations in educational activities and be aligned with the vocations, desires, and realities of each student.

The first major change resulting from the High School Reform and the BNCC rollout is in the duration and number of classes offered. Seduc-SP defined that each class will last 45 minutes, with seven classes per day for all periods, totaling 35 classes per week, with the mandatory allocation of five classes for Inova Educação. Another change occurs in the availability of classes, which will no longer be distributed by subjects but by areas of knowledge. From the 2nd year of high school, the areas of knowledge will be chosen by the students based on their life projects and will be complemented by the training itineraries. We understand that the articulation between the training itineraries

proposed by the 2017 Reform and the BNCC could have an impact on the distribution of classes by areas of knowledge and the likely decrease in the offer of work to teachers of certain subjects training itineraries.

In January 2021, the implementation of training itineraries began for the entire São Paulo public system, specifically for students in the 1st year of high school. According to Seduc-SP (SÃO PAULO, 2021b), all curricular components provided for by the BNCC would be maintained this year. So, the implementation of training itineraries of a curricular and integrated character will only occur in the year 2022, as well as the itineraries of Inova Educação.

Mainly using the São Paulo Media Center (CMSP) channel, due to the social distancing caused by the Covid-19 pandemic (Sars-Cov-2)<sup>2</sup>, Seduc-SP conducted online meetings with little participation from the teaching staff and almost none of the students, and implemented this new model for high school hastily and coercively, creating many uncertainties for both teachers and students.

Six actions were announced by Seduc-SP aiming at the implementation of training itineraries:

Seminars - update and build together new initiatives; Weekly **live** Novo EM - Engage and inform about the potential of Novo EM; Life project classes - Introduce New EM issues to students; Training of multipliers - Train multipliers for the implementation of the New EM; ATPC - Train teachers to work in each area of knowledge; Training paths - Training for the implementation of the New EM. (SÃO PAULO, 2021b).

We used the word **live** highlighted to emphasize that the implementation of the New Currículo Paulista was in the middle of a pandemic and an arbitrary manner. These lives took place both on the CMSP and on the YouTube channel<sup>3</sup>, among other forms of transmission. Another highlight was the initiative to train multipliers, train teachers to adapt to work in each area of knowledge, and use training paths for the implementation of the New High School.

<sup>2</sup> The consequences of the pandemic on education are massive. Thousands of schools remained closed for a long time, and millions of students were left without in-person classes, causing serious consequences for the quality of education. In addition, the growth in distance learning, as well as hybrid forms of teaching in this period, has been used as a justification by sectors that argue in favor of distance education's expansion and use in Basic Education.

<sup>3</sup> Available on: <https://www.youtube.com/c/centrodemídiassp1>. Accessed on: 10 July 2021.

Four phases of planning were also defined aiming at the implementation of the New Currículo Paulista:

Phase 1 - Communication and training: presentation of basic concepts and key messages. Clarification of the main points; Phase 2 - Detailed presentation of curriculum developments; Phase 3 - Definition and choice of curricular deepening by schools and students. Phase 4 - Final preparation for the implementation of the new curriculum. (SÃO PAULO, 2021b).

Phases 1 and 2 took place in the first semester, with the presentation of the training itineraries, and phases 3 and 4, in the second half of 2021, with the definition of the training itineraries. We emphasize again that all these actions took place online, in which interaction by the vast majority of teachers and students was lacking.

With the presentation of the training itineraries at the end of the first semester of 2021, Seduc-SP, using a website<sup>4</sup>, made official for 2022 the curriculum for the 2nd year of the New High School, adding up to 150 hours per semester and 300 hours per academic year, reiterating the importance of these itineraries for the student formation:

The training itineraries are composed of different curricular arrangements, a set of curricular units that allow the student to deepen and expand the learning developed in basic general training, in one or more areas of knowledge, allowing them to experience educational experiences associated with contemporary reality and to promote their personal, professional and citizen education. (SÃO PAULO, 2020a, p. 196).

For Seduc-SP, the organization of these itineraries guarantees students the protagonism in the choice of content based on the curricular flexibility defined by the Reform, which must observe the following criteria:

Art. 36. The high school curriculum will be composed of the Base Nacional Comum Curricular and training itineraries, which should be organized by offering different curricular arrangements, according to the relevance to the local context and the possibility of the education systems, namely: I - languages and their technologies; II - mathematics and its technologies; III - natural sciences and their technologies; IV - applied human and social sciences; V - technical and professional training.

According to Seduc-SP (SÃO PAULO, 2020a), it's necessary to meet the demands of contemporary society and the aspirations of students, stimulating their interests, engagement, and protagonism and ensuring general basic training. Therefore, it is necessary to comply with what is provided for in article 12 of the Diretrizes

<sup>4</sup> Available on: <https://novoensinomedio.educacao.sp.gov.br/>. Accessed on: 20 July 2021.

Curriculares Nacionais do Ensino Médio (DCNEM) of 2018, which, under the terms of Resolution No. 3/2018, of the Conselho Nacional de Educação, defined that the training itineraries of the different areas and technical and professional training must be organized considering four structuring axes: scientific research, creative processes, mediation, and socio-cultural intervention and entrepreneurship.

According to Seduc-SP, all schools must offer at least two options for an in-depth curriculum, and all areas of knowledge must be included in the options offered by the school. For example, if the school has only one class in the final year of high school, the class will be divided into two. One of the curricular arrangements that these classes can have is a class A with an integrated curriculum itinerary of Languages and Mathematics, and the other class B will have an integrated curriculum itinerary in the area of Natural Sciences and Social Human Sciences (SÃO PAULO, 2021b).

After presenting the training itineraries through the website, they offered to the students, from the Secretaria da Escolar Digital (SED)<sup>5</sup>, the 11 training itineraries that can be chosen for the 2022 academic year. Among the 11 training itineraries, five are curricular training in a specific area, and six are integrated curricular training. They are:

#seLiganaMídia (in-depth curriculum in the area of languages and their technologies); Overcoming challenges is in the humanities (in-depth curriculum in the area of applied human and social sciences 1); Leadership and citizenship (in-depth curriculum in the area of applied human and social sciences 2); Science in action! (in-depth curriculum in the area of natural sciences and their technologies); Connected Mathematics (in-depth curriculum in the area of mathematics and its technologies); Start! Challenge time! (integrated curriculum development in languages and their technologies and mathematics and their technologies); Body, health and languages (integrated curriculum development in languages and their technologies and natural sciences and their technologies); Culture in motion: different ways of narrating the human experience (integrated curriculum development in languages and their technologies and applied human and social sciences); #quem\_divide\_multiplica (integrated curriculum development in mathematics and its technologies and applied human and social sciences); My role in sustainable development (integrated curriculum development in natural sciences and their technologies and applied human and social sciences); Ground culture: from the countryside to the city (integrated curriculum development in natural sciences and their technologies and applied human and social sciences). (SÃO PAULO, 2021a).

With a strong appeal to young people with symbol “#” (*hashtag* – that indexes the most talked about topics in social networks), the curriculum itinerary in the area of

<sup>5</sup> Available on: <https://sed.educacao.sp.gov.br>. Accessed on: 8 Nov. 2021.

Languages and its Technologies “#seLiganaMídia” and the curriculum itinerary integrated with Applied Human and Social Sciences and Mathematics and its Technologies “#quem\_divide\_multiplica” demonstrate, in our understanding, that the theme of the itinerary can induce young people to these areas of knowledge, especially in the itinerary related to Mathematics. Another key factor is that this list of curricular itineraries offered to students has a bigger number of itineraries of integrated curriculum development in relation to itineraries by area, since, as mentioned earlier, schools must offer at least two integrated curriculum itineraries.

For Ferretti (2018), when analyzing Law nº 13.415/2017, which is the base of Curriculum Paulista, students won't be free to choose the itineraries that can enhance their life projects, given that, as disclosed in the list above, it is already clear that students can choose only those itineraries offered, that is, their definition is the prerogative of the state, the student must adapt to what is already in place.

Critics of the 2012 DCNEM, especially in the private sector, claimed that the curriculum by subjects, which promoted specific training, would be rigid and inflexible, with an excess of content for High School. The rigid 2012 curriculum gave way to a flexible curriculum, which, in theory, should meet the aspirations of the new glamorized worker of the 21st century: adaptable, autonomous, and creative. From this flexible perspective of the curriculum, in the new education system, the autonomy of the new worker lies in the development of socio-emotional skills, which can be developed mainly in the subjects of Inova Educação: Life Project, Electives, and Technology.

According to Ferretti (2018), curricular flexibility as a unique solution against the excess of subjects and structural rigidity, already incorporated by law 13.415/2017 and consequently by the BNCC, fails when trying to remedy the low quality of this final stage of Basic Education and trying to solve the problem of dropouts and students failing grades. According to the author, it isn't enough just to offer students a flexible curriculum if there is no investment in the infrastructure of schools (cultural activities, library, spaces for Physical Education, laboratories, etc.), continued training for teachers, improvement in teachers' salaries, among others.

In the same line of criticism, we maintain that the proposed curricular flexibility, connected to the offer of full-time schools for seven hours a day, due to the

Brazilian structural social inequality, has greater potential for exclusion than for inclusion, as students who most need it end up in night school. Even with the possibility of choice by the students, using their protagonism and their interests, there is no guarantee that the quality of classes will increase or that students will fail less. In summary, for the author, the New São Paulo High School program, by betting on diversity, make the curriculum more flexible with the training itineraries to meet the interests of the student body:

But it does so only from the perspective of the development of cognitive and socio-emotional skills, giving little attention to the social production of different young people and the objective conditions in which public schools operate as if the limitations that determined such production that are still present in schools could be overcome through a flexible curriculum and the use of methodologies, digital equipment and teaching materials that encourage student protagonism. (FERRETTI, 2018, p. 32).

The flexibility proposed by the New São Paulo High School program is directly related to flexible learning by promoting a flexible curriculum for the students' choices according to their reality. By choosing only one area of knowledge in High School to meet possible trajectories and life projects, students have their training reduced to utilitarian and momentary pragmatism fostered by the fleeting private sector instead of having access to a comprehensive education.

This seductive offer of the training itineraries offered by the New São Paulo High School, announces what the new generations want to hear and in their language, as in the announced training itinerary of the Languages area #seLiganaMidia, it only promotes an illusory education that is dissociated from the needs of general training, perpetuates structural duality, and does not provide for the modernization claimed by the training itineraries.

We understand that, with this curricular flexibility, the social function of the school and the teaching practice, and the teaching-learning process of significant contents will be directly affected, because “[...] the school is about designed knowledge and not about spontaneous knowledge; to systematized knowledge and not to fragmented knowledge; to high culture and not to popular culture” (SAVIANI, 2000, p. 19).

## 5 Final considerations

It's initially worth mentioning in these final considerations that the so-called New São Paulo High School is not so new. It re-signifies and deepens the same processes and theses that characterize the structural duality, which has been defining High School over time, using power and coercion as a usual policy, a common practice used by the São Paulo government, as shown by recent processes of implementation of the educational policies in the state over the last few years.

The New São Paulo High School proposed by Seduc-SP, in the essence of its theses, isn't that much different from other recent policies, but it can deepen the problems faced by High School. The imposition of curricular flexibility, based on the implementation of training itineraries, is in line with the recommendations of multilateral organizations, such as the United Nations Educational, The United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (Unesco), and the theses led by the private sector, deepens the process of negating general training and weakening the curriculum. Making Portuguese Language and Mathematics mandatory obscures and disqualifies the curriculum, imposing immense limitations on a broader education.

It deepens the problems, as it instrumentalizes the curriculum and creates the false expectation of options for students, since what is advertised as training itineraries doesn't make it possible to improve professional training and preparation for the job market, it also significantly reduces general education. It accentuates the logic of duality, as it deepens the fragility of public education in which the reform will be imposed, while the education offered in private schools will continue to provide its students, in theory, with an integral formation.

By making the curriculum more flexible, we understand that what will be offered to students is minimal content, with an empty training prevailing, both in sociocultural and scientific knowledge. Seduc-SP propagates, mainly through the media channel, the CMSP, that the valorization of the students' protagonism and the choices of training itineraries will provide a complete and integral education. We raise the following question: how to guarantee this integral education if what is being proposed is precisely the emptying of general education with fewer subjects connected to general education being offered? A Seduc-SP proposes conceptual reductionism, which aims to

disseminate the idea that general training is that provided by training itineraries, which will be defined from the expectations and perspectives of professional training, in theory, defined by students.

Another important issue to be mentioned is the impact that curricular flexibility and training itineraries have on the teaching career. In addition to reducing the workload of all teachers, such actions contribute to a degree of uncertainty in the allocation of classes each academic year, including for Portuguese and Mathematics teachers, in theory, privileged by the reform, as they are the only subjects that will be on the list of subjects offered by the BNCC throughout the three years of São Paulo High School.

The New Paulista Curriculum (SÃO PAULO, 2020a) proposed by Seduc-SP proclaims the training itineraries and curricular flexibility as axes for the organization of High School, from the perspective of the development of cognitive and socio-emotional skills. It argues that the proposed reform revolutionizes education in its content and form, as it creates the possibility for students to choose their training itineraries. On the contrary, we understand that the reform fosters uncertainty among teachers each school year, further disqualifies the curriculum, and makes it difficult for public school students to access knowledge historically produced by humanity, contributing to the maintenance of structural duality and the destruction of public education.

A good metaphor to define what the High School Reform proposes like an empty vase: the aesthetics, however good it may be, doesn't change the essence and emptiness that characterizes it.

## 6 References

BRASIL. *Base Nacional Comum Curricular*. Brasília, DF: MEC, 2018.

BRASIL. Lei nº 9.394, de 20 de dezembro de 1996. Estabelece as Diretrizes e Bases da Educação Nacional. *Diário Oficial [da] República Federativa do Brasil*, Poder Executivo, Brasília, DF, 21 dez. 1996.

BRASIL. Lei nº 13.415, de 16 de fevereiro de 2017. Altera as Leis nºs 9.394, de 20 de dezembro de 1996, que estabelece as Diretrizes e Bases da Educação Nacional, e 11.494, de 20 de junho 2007, que regulamenta o Fundo de Manutenção e Desenvolvimento da Educação Básica e de Valorização dos Profissionais da Educação, a Consolidação das Leis do Trabalho - CLT, aprovada pelo Decreto-Lei nº 5.452, de 1º de maio de 1943, e o Decreto-Lei nº 236, de 28 de fevereiro de 1967; revoga a Lei nº

11.161, de 5 de agosto de 2005; e institui a Política de Fomento à Implementação de Escolas de Ensino Médio em Tempo Integral. *Diário Oficial [da] República Federativa do Brasil*, Poder Executivo, Brasília, DF, 17 fev. 2017.

BRASIL. Resolução nº 3, de 21 de novembro de 2018. Atualiza as Diretrizes Curriculares Nacionais para o Ensino Médio. *Diário Oficial [da] República Federativa do Brasil*, Poder Executivo, Brasília, DF, 22 nov. 2018.

FERRETTI, C. J. A reforma do Ensino Médio e sua questionável concepção de qualidade da educação. *Estudos Avançados*, São Paulo, v. 32, n. 93, p. 25-42, 2018.

HERNANDES, P. R. A reforma do Ensino Médio e a produção de desigualdades na educação escolar. *Educação*, Santa Maria, v. 44, p. 1-19, 2019. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.5902/1984644434731>. Available in: <https://periodicos.ufsm.br/reeducacao/article/view/34731/pdf>. Accessed on: 11 May 2022.

RAMOS, M. N. Ensino médio no Brasil contemporâneo: coerção revestida de consenso no “Estado de exceção”. *Revista Nova Paideia: Revista Interdisciplinar em Educação e Pesquisa*, Brasília, DF, v. 1, n. 1, p. 2-11, 2019. DOI: 10.36732/riep.v1i1.19. Available in: <https://ojs.novapaideia.org/index.php/riep/article/view/11>. Accessed on: 17 Apr. 2021.

RAMOS, M. N.; FRIGOTTO, G. Medida Provisória 746/2016: a contrarreforma do ensino médio do golpe de estado de 31 de agosto de 2016. *Revista Histedbr*, Campinas, n. 70, p. 30-48, 2016. Available in: <http://periodicos.sbu.unicamp.br/ojs/index.php/histedbr/article/view/8649207/15754>. Accessed on: 14 Jul. 2021.

RAMOS, M. N.; FRIGOTTO, G. “Resistir é preciso, fazer não é preciso”: as contrarreformas do ensino médio no Brasil. *Cadernos de Pesquisa em Educação*, Vitória, v. 19, n. 46, p. 26-47, 2017. Available in: <https://periodicos.ufes.br/index.php/educacao/article/view/19329>. Accessed on: 18 May 2021.

SÃO PAULO. *Catálogo das ementas detalhadas dos aprofundamentos curriculares*. São Paulo: Secretaria da Educação do Estado, 2021a. Available in: [https://novoensinomedio.educacao.sp.gov.br/assets/docs\\_ni/catalogo\\_detalhado\\_aprofundamentos\\_curriculares.pdf](https://novoensinomedio.educacao.sp.gov.br/assets/docs_ni/catalogo_detalhado_aprofundamentos_curriculares.pdf). Accessed on: 11 Aug. 2021.

SÃO PAULO. *Currículo Paulista Etapa: Ensino Médio*. São Paulo: Secretaria da Educação do Estado, 2020a. Available in: <https://efape.educacao.sp.gov.br/curriculopaulista/ensino-medio/>. Access on: 1st Dec. 2020.

SÃO PAULO. Resolução Seduc nº 85, de 19 de novembro de 2020. Estabelece as diretrizes da organização curricular do Ensino Fundamental, do Ensino Médio e das respectivas modalidades de ensino da Rede Estadual de Ensino de São Paulo e dá providências correlatas. *Diário Oficial do Estado de São Paulo*, Poder Executivo, São Paulo, 20 nov. 2020b.

SÃO PAULO. *Seminário Novo Ensino Médio Diretores*. São Paulo: Secretaria da Educação do Estado, 2021b. Available in: [https://efape.educacao.sp.gov.br/curriculopaulista/wp-content/uploads/2021/01/semina%cc%81rio%20novo%20ensino%20me%cc%81dio\\_diretores%20de%20escola.pdf?t=1614097834](https://efape.educacao.sp.gov.br/curriculopaulista/wp-content/uploads/2021/01/semina%cc%81rio%20novo%20ensino%20me%cc%81dio_diretores%20de%20escola.pdf?t=1614097834). Access on: 30 Mar. 2021.

SAVIANI, D. *Pedagogia histórico-crítica: primeiras aproximações*. 7. ed. Campinas: Autores Associados, 2000.

SAVIANI, D. Trabalho e educação: fundamentos ontológicos e históricos. *Revista Brasileira de Educação*, Rio de Janeiro, v. 12, n. 34, 2007. Available in: <http://www.scielo.br/pdf/rbedu/v12n34/a12v1234.pdf>. Accessed on: 25 Apr. 2021.

**Celso do Prado Ferraz de Carvalho**, Nove de Julho University, Graduate Program in Education

 <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-8703-8236>

PhD in Education. Professor of the Graduate Program in Education at Universidade Nove de Julho. Leader of the research group on Educational Policy and Management.

Author's contribution: Research supervision, data analysis contributions, text revision, and expansion.

Lattes: <http://lattes.cnpq.br/2546257820365753>

E-mail: [cpfcarvalho@gmail.com](mailto:cpfcarvalho@gmail.com)

**Fabio Cavalcanti**, Nove de Julho University, Graduate Program in Education

 <http://orcid.org/0000-0003-4236-9458>

Doctoral candidate in Education at Universidade Nove de Julho. Graduated in Physics from Instituto Federal de Educação, São Paulo campus. Full-time teacher in São Paulo public school system.

Author's contribution: Research design, data collection, and analysis.

Lattes: <http://lattes.cnpq.br/9579080312278562>

E-mail: [fabbiocant@gmail.com](mailto:fabbiocant@gmail.com)

**Responsible editor:** Lia Machado Fiuza Fialho

**Ad hoc experts:** Norberto Dallabrida and Maria Oliveira

#### How to cite this article (ABNT):

CARVALHO, Celso do Prado Ferraz de; CAVALCANTI, Fabio. The New High School in São Paulo: old proposals for maintaining the structural duality and the precariousness of education. *Educ. Form.*, Fortaleza, v. 7, e7317, 2022. Available in:

<https://revistas.uece.br/index.php/redufor/article/view/7317>



Received December 20, 2021.

Accepted on April 18, 2022.

Published on May 22, 2022.

